Fact Sheets Supporting
“Do Not Delist” Recommendations

September 2005

Region 7

Water Segment: Alamo River

Pollutant: Selenium

Decision: Do Not Delist

Weight of Evidence: This pollutant is being considered for delisting under sections 4.6 and 4.9 of the Listing Policy. Under section 4.6 a single line of evidence is necessary to assess listing status while under section 4.5, a minimum of two lines of evidence are needed to assess listing status. Three lines of evidence are available in the administrative record to assess this pollutant.

Based on the readily available data and information, the weight of evidence indicates that there is insufficient justification in favor of removing this water segment-pollutant combination from the section 303(d) list in the Water Quality Limited Segments category.

This conclusion is based on the staff findings that:
1. The tissue guideline used complies with the requirements of section 6.1.3 of the Policy.
2. The data used satisfies the data quality requirements of section 6.1.4 of the Policy.
3. The data used satisfies the data quantity requirements of section 6.1.5 of the Policy.
4. None of 7 water samples exceeded the CTR criterion. The detection limit for these water samples is too high which makes it difficult to evaluate this data in terms of the Listing Policy. One of 27 tissue samples exceeded the fish consumption standard, and these do not exceed the allowable frequency listed in Table 4.1 of the Listing Policy. However, the number of samples is insufficient to determine with the confidence and power required by the Listing Policy.
5. Pursuant to section 4.11 of the Listing Policy, no additional data and information are available indicating that standards are met.

SWRCB Staff Recommendation: After review of the available data and information, SWRCB staff concludes that the water body-pollutant combination should not be removed from on the section 303(d) list because applicable water quality standards are exceeded and a pollutant contributes to or causes the problem.

Lines of Evidence:

Numeric Line of Evidence Pollutant-Tissue

Beneficial Use: CM - Commercial and Sport Fishing (CA), FR - Freshwater Replenishment, SH - Shellfish Harvesting

Matrix: Tissue

Water Quality Objective/ Water Quality Criterion: 2 ug/g OEHHA Screening Value.

Data Used to Assess Water Quality:	One of 27 samples for selenium in fish tissue taken between June 1978 and November 2000 exceeded the fish consumption standard (TSMP, 2002).
Temporal Representation:	Samples were collected between June 1978 to November 2000.
Data Quality Assessment:	Toxic Substance Monitoring Program QAPP.

Numeric Line of Evidence	Pollutant-Water
Beneficial Use:	CM - Commercial and Sport Fishing (CA), FR - Freshwater Replenishment, SH - Shellfish Harvesting
Matrix:	Water
Water Quality Objective/ Water Quality Criterion:	CTR: freshwater acute maximum = 20 ppb and freshwater chronic maximum = 5 ppb.
Data Used to Assess Water Quality:	Data were collected by the RWQCB on 6/21/2001 at 7 different stations on the Alamo River. All samples were non-detects, with a detection limit of 100 ppb (CRBRWQCB, 2004c).
Spatial Representation:	Samples were collected the following Alamo River sampling stations: AR-B (at the International Boundary), AR-D10 (Lower Alamo River drainshed, at Drop Structure #10), AR-D8 (Central Drain drainshed, at Drop Structure #8), AR-D6A (Holtville Main Drain drainshed, at Drop Structure #6A), AR-D6 (Rose Drain drainshed, at Drop Structure #6), AR-D3 (Central Alamo River drainshed, at Drop Structure #3), and at AR-GRB.
Temporal Representation:	All samples were collected on 6/21/2001.
Data Quality Assessment:	Used RWQCB QA/QC in sample collection. Lab analysis was done by North Coast Labs.

Line of Evidence	Remedial Program in Place
Beneficial Use	CM - Commercial and Sport Fishing (CA), FR - Freshwater Replenishment, SH - Shellfish Harvesting
Information Used to Assess Water Quality:	TMDL completed (SWRCB, 2003).

Region 7

Water Segment:	Imperial Valley Drains
Pollutant:	Selenium
Decision:	Do Not Delist
Weight of Evidence:	This pollutant is being considered for removal from the section 303(d) list under section 4.1 of the Listing Policy. Under section 4.1 a single line of evidence is necessary to assess delisting status. One line of evidence is available in the administrative record to assess this pollutant. A large number of samples exceed the water quality objective. Based on the readily available data and information, the weight of evidence indicates that there is sufficient justification against removing this water segment-pollutant combination from the section 303(d) list. This conclusion is based on the staff findings that: 1. The data used satisfies the data quality requirements of section 6.1.4 of the Policy. 2. The data used satisfies the data quantity requirements of section 6.1.5 of the Policy. 3. Seven of 69 fish tissue samples exceeded the water quality objective for the fish consumption standard and this exceeds the allowable frequency listed in Table 4.1 of the Listing Policy. 4. Pursuant to section 4.11 of the Listing Policy, no additional data and information are available indicating that standards are met.
SWRCB Staff Recommendation:	After review of the available data and information, SWRCB staff concludes that the water body-pollutant combination should not be removed from on the section 303(d) list because applicable water quality standards are exceeded and a pollutant contributes to or causes the problem.
Lines of Evidence:	

Numeric Line of Evidence	Pollutant-Tissue
Beneficial Use:	CO - Cold Freshwater Habitat
Matrix:	Tissue
Water Quality Objective/ Water Quality Criterion:	OEHHA screening value for selenium 2 ppm.
Data Used to Assess Water Quality:	Seven of 69 samples for selenium in fish tissue taken between October 1986 and November of 2000 exceeded the fish consumption standard (TSMP, 2002).
Spatial Representation:	unknown

Temporal Representation:	Samples collected between October 1986 and November 2000.
Data Quality Assessment:	Toxic Substances Monitoring Program Database 1978-2000.

Region 7

Water Segment:	New River (Imperial)
Pollutant:	Oxygen, Dissolved
Decision:	Do Not Delist
Weight of Evidence:	Two lines of evidence are available in the administrative record to assess this pollutant. Based on section 4.6, the site has significant toxicity. The benthic community is impacted. Based on the readily available data and information, the weight of evidence indicates that there is sufficient justification against removing this water segment-pollutant combination from the section 303(d) list in the Water Quality Limited Segments category. This conclusion is based on the staff findings that: 1. The sediment quality guideline used complies with the requirements of section 6.1.3 of the Policy. 2. The data used satisfies the data quality requirements of section 6.1.4 of the Policy. 3. The data used satisfies the data quantity requirements of section 6.1.5 of the Policy. 4. Eighty three of 116 samples exceeded the water quality objective, and additionally, there were a total of 3264 measurements taken over 16 days. The objective was exceeded numerous times on 14 of those 16 collection days. A large number of samples exhibit toxicity, and these exceed the allowable frequency listed in Table 4.2 of the Listing Policy. The benthic community in this water body is impacted and this pollutant is associated with this impact. 5. Pursuant to section 4.11 of the Listing Policy, no additional data and information are available indicating that standards are met.
SWRCB Staff Recommendation:	After review of the available data and information, SWRCB staff concludes that the water body-pollutant combination should not be removed from on the section 303(d) list because applicable water quality standards are exceeded and a pollutant contributes to or causes the problem.
Lines of Evidence:	

Numeric Line of Evidence	Pollutant-Water
Beneficial Use:	FR - Freshwater Replenishment, IN - Industrial Service Supply, R1 - Water Contact Recreation, R2 - Non-Contact Recreation, RA - Rare & Endangered Species, WA - Warm Freshwater Habitat, WI - Wildlife Habitat
Matrix:	Water
Water Quality Objective/ Water Quality Criterion:	Colorado River RWQCB Basin Plan: The dissolved oxygen concentration for waters designated as warm freshwater habitat shall not be reduced below 5 mg/L.
Data Used to Assess Water Quality:	Samples were collected on 83 different days from January 1997 through March 2004. Measurements were taken monthly. There were 83 exceedances of these

	83 measurements. Samples were collected from January to December of 1999. Eighteen days of samples were collected and of the 18 samples there were 5 exceedances. D.O. levels dropped below 5 mg/L (3.54-4.95 mg/L) in 5 samples collected in June, July, August, and September. Samples were also collected by IID in 1997 and 1998. There were 3 exceedances of these 15 measurements (SWRQCB, 2003).
Spatial Representation:	The 83 samples were collected from the New River at the International Boundary. Specific sample collection locations are unknown for the 18 and 15 sample sizes.
Temporal Representation:	The 83 samples collected each month from January 1997 to March 2004. There are no data for October, November, and December of 1999. The 18 samples were collected from 1/21/1999 through 12/14/1999. Samples were collected once a month, except during April through September when there were two samples collected each month. The 15 samples were collected monthly from 1/28/1997 through 3/17/1998.
Environmental Conditions:	For the 83 samples, other field measurements include flow, temperature, pH, and conductivity. Field observations were also recorded. For the 18 samples, all measurements were taken at a depth of 0.5 meters. Samples were taken twice a month during the warmer months of April through September.
Data Quality Assessment:	Data used in 2002 assessment. Also used IID SOPs.
QA/QC Equivalent:	QA/QC used by RWQCB staff.

Numeric Line of Evidence	Pollutant-Water
Beneficial Use:	FR - Freshwater Replenishment, IN - Industrial Service Supply, R1 - Water Contact Recreation, R2 - Non-Contact Recreation, RA - Rare & Endangered Species, WA - Warm Freshwater Habitat, WI - Wildlife Habitat
Matrix:	Water
Water Quality Objective/ Water Quality Criterion:	Colorado River RWQCB Basin Plan: The dissolved oxygen concentration for waters designated as warm freshwater habitat shall not be reduced below 5 mg/L.
Data Used to Assess Water Quality:	Samples were collected by the RWQCB during July of 1999. There were a total of 3264 measurements over 16 days. The objective was exceeded numerous times on 14 of those collection days (SWRCB, 2003).
Spatial Representation:	Samples were collected on the New River at Mexicali.
Temporal Representation:	Measurements were taken multiple times (every few minutes) each day from 7/7/99 through 7/23/99 (No measurements were taken on 7/20/99.)
Environmental Conditions:	Other information collected includes water temperature, conductivity, and pH.
QA/QC Equivalent:	QA/QC used by RWQCB staff.

Region 7

Water Segment:	New River (Imperial)
Pollutant:	Sediment
Decision:	Do Not Delist
Weight of Evidence:	This pollutant is being considered for listing under section 2.2 of the Listing Policy. Under this section of the Policy, a minimum of one line of evidence is needed to assess listing status. One line of evidence is available in the administrative record to assess this pollutant. Based on the applicable factor, a TMDL has been developed and approved by USEPA and an approved implementation plan is expected to result in attainment of the standard. Based on the readily available data and information, the weight of evidence indicates that there is sufficient justification against removing this water segment-pollutant combination from the section 303(d) list in the Water Quality Limited Segments category as it has not been demonstrated that standards have yet been attained.
SWRCB Staff Recommendation:	After review of the available data and information for this recommendation, SWRCB staff conclude that the water body should be placed in the Water Quality Limited Segments Being Addressed category of the section 303(d) list because a TMDL has been approved by USEPA and an implementation plan has been approved.
Lines of Evidence:	

Line of Evidence	Remedial Program in Place
Beneficial Use	WA - Warm Freshwater Habitat
Information Used to Assess Water Quality:	A TMDL and implementation plan has been approved for this water segment-pollutant combination. The New River Sedimentation/Siltation TMDL was approved by RWQCB on June 26, 2002 and subsequently approved by USEPA on March 31, 2003.

Region 7

Water Segment: Salton Sea

Pollutant: Salinity

Decision: Do Not Delist

Weight of Evidence: This pollutant is being considered for removal from the section 303(d) list under section 4.1 of the Listing Policy. Under section 4.1 a single line of evidence is necessary to assess delisting status.

One line of evidence is available in the administrative record to assess this pollutant. A large number of samples exceed the water quality objective.

Based on the readily available data and information, the weight of evidence indicates that there is sufficient justification against removing this water segment-pollutant combination from the section 303(d) list.

This conclusion is based on the staff findings that:
3. The data used satisfies the data quality requirements of section 6.1.4 of the Policy.
4. The data used satisfies the data quantity requirements of section 6.1.5 of the Policy.
3. Eighty six of 89 samples exceeded the water quality objective and this exceeds the allowable frequency listed in Table 4.1 of the Listing Policy.
4. Pursuant to section 4.11 of the Listing Policy, no additional data and information are available indicating that standards are met.

SWRCB Staff Recommendation: After review of the available data and information, SWRCB staff concludes that the water body-pollutant combination should not be removed from on the section 303(d) list because applicable water quality standards are exceeded and a pollutant contributes to or causes the problem.

Lines of Evidence:

Line of Evidence Pollutant-Water

Beneficial Use AQ - Aquaculture, IN - Industrial Service Supply, R1 - Water Contact Recreation, R2 - Non-Contact Recreation, RA - Rare & Endangered Species, WA - Warm Freshwater Habitat, WI - Wildlife Habitat

Non-Numeric Objective: The water quality objective for Salton Sea is to reduce the present level of salinity, and stabilize it at 35,000 mg/l unless it can be demonstrated that a different level of salinity is optimal for the sustenance of the Sea's wild and aquatic life (California Department of Fish and Game is attempting to make this determination). However, the achievement of this water quality objective shall be accomplished without adversely affecting the primary purpose of the Sea which is to receive and store agricultural drainage, seepage, and storm waters. Also, because of economic considerations, 35,000 mg/l may not be realistically achievable. In such case, any reduction in salinity which still allows for survival of the sea's aquatic life shall be deemed an acceptable alternative or interim objective. Because of the difficulty and predicted costliness of achieving salinity

	stabilization of Salton Sea, it is unreasonable for the Regional Board to assume responsibility for implementation of this objective. That responsibility must be shared jointly by all of the agencies which have direct influence on the Sea's fate. Additionally, there must be considerable public support for achieving this objective, without which it is unlikely necessary funding for Salton Sea salinity control will ever be realized.
Data Used to Assess Water Quality:	Samples were collected by IID at 5 locations around the Salton Sea twice annually from 1995 to 2003. A total of 89 measurements were taken and only 3 measurements were less than 35,000 mg/L and 86 exceeded. Two of those measurements were at the "between rivers" site. Salinity data from this site is generally excluded from the IID Salt Balance Report due to possible influence of fresh water from the New and Alamo Rivers (CRBRWQCB, 2004).
Spatial Representation:	Samples were collected at 5 locations around the outer edge of the Salton Sea: Bertram Station, Desert Beach, Salton Sea Beach, Sandy Beach, and Between Rivers.
Temporal Representation:	Samples were collected twice annually (spring and fall) from 5/10/1995 through 10/23/2003.

Page left blank intentionally.